

---

**To:** Mayor and Council

**From:** Sasha HelmKay, Deputy Clerk

**Date:** October 7, 2020

**Subject:** Heritage Evaluation – Anten Mills Community Centre

---

### Report Highlights

- Council approved the Heritage Advisory Committee conducting heritage evaluations of the 6 community halls owned by the Township.
- The Committee conducted an evaluation of the Anten Mills Community Centre on December 3, 2019 based on the heritage evaluation guidelines adopted in 2013.
- From this evaluation, the Committee recognized the hall's attractive design and physical value as the former Anten Mills School, significance to the community and history as being a part of the early education system in rural Ontario.
- Based on the evaluation, the Committee is recommending to Council to formally designate the Anten Mills Community Centre a heritage property under Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

### Recommendation

That the report from the Deputy Clerk regarding the Heritage Evaluation – Anten Mills Community Centre, dated October 7, 2020, be received; and,

#### Option 1

That Council support the recommendation from the Heritage Advisory Committee to formally designate the Anten Mills Community Centre, located at 3985 Horseshoe Valley Road, a heritage property under section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act; and,

That the Deputy Clerk be directed to begin the designation process as outlined under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Or

#### Option 2

That Council does not support formally designating the Anten Mills Community Centre, located at 3985 Horseshoe Valley Road, a heritage property under section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Or

### Option 3

That Council approve listing the Anten Mills Community Centre, located at 3985 Horseshoe Valley Road, on the Heritage Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (not designated) in accordance with Section 27(1.2) of the Ontario Heritage Act.

### Background

At the May 16, 2018 meeting, Council approved the Heritage Advisory Committee's request to evaluate Township owned community halls for cultural, heritage value. The Heritage Committee developed a three-year Heritage Evaluation Schedule, planning to evaluate two community halls annually. Below is the schedule:

Year	Date	Community Hall
2019	Fall	Midhurst Community Centre
	Fall	Anten Mills Community Centre
2020	Spring	Elmvale Community Hall
	Fall	Grenfel Community Centre
2021	Spring	Hillsdale Community Centre
	Fall	Minesing Community Centre

Due to COVID-19 this schedule has been amended as the 2020 evaluations of the Elmvale Community Hall and the Grenfel Community Centre were unable to occur. These evaluations have been re-scheduled to Spring 2022.

### Heritage Evaluation Guidelines

To evaluate properties consistently and fairly, the heritage guidelines and evaluation form, attached as Schedule "A", were developed by the Committee in 2013 in conjunction with legislative requirements. To determine significant historical or cultural value, the Ontario Heritage Act through Regulation 9/06 identifies three equally weighted sections for determining the value of a property:

- Design and Physical Value
  - is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
  - displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
  - demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
  
- Historical and Associative Value
  - has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
  - yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or
  - demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.
  
- Contextual Value
  - is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area,
  - is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
  - is a landmark. O. Reg. 9/06, s. 1 (2).

The Township’s Heritage Evaluation Guidelines evaluate properties based on these three criteria, and further focus on specific sections under each. The guidelines are used to evaluate all potential properties (private or public) that are being considered for a heritage designation under section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. Points are attributed to each category. Each category has five subcategories and is assigned a point value of 0-4. This totals 20 points per section which has a maximum point value of 60 for all three categories.

**Evaluation Point Value System**

The point values, and resultant Group values, for each of the three sections separately is as follows:

Point Value	Group Value
13+	Group A
9 – 12	Group B
5 – 8	Group C
0 – 4	Group D

For the overall value, the total value of points from all three criteria categories is used to determine the heritage value of the property. The total point values, and resultant Group values, are as follows:

Point Value	Group Value
29+	Group A
25 – 28	Group B
13 – 24	Group C
0 – 12	Group D

A Group A value represents a building or landmark that is of major significance to the Township. A Group B value is of importance. A Group C is of value as part of the Township and a Group D value is of some importance.

A scoring of Group A in any of these areas qualifies the building for a heritage designation, as well as a total of a Group A value in all three criteria categories. A total of a Group B value may be considered for designation at the discretion of the Heritage Committee.

### Anten Mills Community Centre Heritage Evaluation

On December 3, 2019, the Heritage Advisory Committee conducted a heritage evaluation of the Anten Mills Community Centre, located at 3985 Horseshoe Valley Road. Prior to the evaluation, members of the Anten Mills Community Recreation Association provided history and information on the hall. This historical information can be found in the link under “Background or Relevant Reports” within the Heritage Committee’s December 3<sup>rd</sup> agenda. This history assisted members in evaluating each of the qualifications under the criteria categories. Attached as Schedule “B” is the completed evaluation of the Anten Mills Community Centre and below is a summary of the point value scores:

Category	Point Value	Group Value
Design & Physical Value	10	B
Historical & Associative Value	13	A
Contextual Value	13	A
<b>Total Point Value</b>	<b>36</b>	
<b>Overall Group Value</b>		<b>A</b>

The overall total point value for the Anten Mills Community Centre's evaluation was 36/60, which equates to an "A" as the overall group value. As per the evaluation guidelines, a total of a Group A or a score of Group A in any of these areas qualifies the building for a heritage designation.

At the Committee's January 28, 2020 meeting, members reviewed the evaluation again in detail, discussing different design elements of the community centre and its important connection to the community. At this meeting, the Committee passed the following resolution:

### **Resolution**

Moved by: Gannon

Seconded by: Archer

Whereas the Township of Springwater Heritage Advisory Committee conducted a Heritage Evaluation of the Anten Mills Community Centre, located at 3985 Horseshoe Valley Road West, on December 3, 2019; and,

Whereas the Committee reviewed the evaluation and the features of the Community Centre in relation to Design and Physical Value, Historical and Associative Value and Contextual Value at their January 28, 2020 meeting; and,

Whereas after reviewing the evaluation and assessing the category values provided within the Evaluation Form, the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends to Council that:

The Anten Mills Community Centre be formally designated a heritage property under Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act;

And that the Deputy Clerk be directed to provide a report to Council outlining the Committee's reasons for its recommendation.

### **Carried**

To provide context to the Committee's recommendation, below is a review of the key reasons for point values attributed to the criteria categories for the Anten Mills Community Centre in relation to the heritage guidelines.

#### **Design and Physical Value**

**Score: 10 / 20**

The Heritage Advisory Committee recognized that the Anten Mills Community Centre is generally well designed and attractive, as it has retained the look of its original use as the old Anten Mills School. The style of the building is good where the original features if not already restored, can be restored. The style is notable as it's an example of the architectural style of rural school houses. The school was built in 1891 by Mr. Batterick, a carpenter for Mr. Charles Anderson, the property owner who donated the land for the school. Although local to the area, the architect and builder are not significant. The

school was built using donated lumber from Mr. Anderson and bricks that were said to cost \$3.00 per thousand. The construction is one of many examples of how school houses were built in Ontario. The interior of the building reflects the original construction, with the dominant character of the school house intact while currently being used as the community centre. The wainscoting inside is original, as well as the trim around the windows. The original hardwood floor is still underneath the current tile floor and the tongue and groove ceiling remains underneath the drop ceiling that is in place. One of the most interesting features of the building is the bell tower which is original and still has the bell within it. With some original features still in place, the Committee did recognize that some bricks have been replaced, a new steel roof has been installed and the plumbing and electrical was updated with the addition in 2002. Below are some pictures of the Anten Mills Community Centre taken on December 3, 2019 and in September 2020:





### Historical and Associative Value

Score: 13 / 20

The score for the age of a building is pre-determined in the heritage guidelines. Being built in 1891, the age of the Anten Mills Community Centre scored in the very good range. As provided in the history of the building forming part of the Heritage Committee's December 3, 2019 agenda, the community centre was originally the Anten Mills School. With the mill in the area increasing the population and making it a thriving community, a new school was required as the previous one built in 1875 could only accommodate 90 pupils. The school that currently stands on the site today was completed in 1892 and remained a school until 1967 when students were transferred to Minesing Central School. In 1972 the School Board finally conveyed the land to the Township of Vespra for use as a community centre, with the first hall board already being established in 1971. The building's association with the education system in Ontario was significant to the Anten Mills community, which is why the Heritage Committee scored the community centre a 4 on its associative value to a person or group. Although many school events and activities took place at the property during its years as a school and a community centre, there is no historic event that is directly

associated with the building. As per the heritage guidelines only a few buildings will rate under this category. The Anten Mills Community Centre has an intimate connection with the trend of providing education in rural Ontario communities. This social history is of importance and is how many communities grew and residents became connected with one another. In regards to alterations the Heritage Committee saw that the building has change moderately over the years but many of the original features and material have been retained. Such as the front entrance, the bell tower, brick façade and interior features outlined above under design and physical value.

### Contextual Value

Score: **13 / 20**

When looking at the contextual value of the Anten Mills Community Centre the Committee agreed that the setting is compatible with area buildings as many of the older farm houses and buildings share similar brick façades. The site of the school has remained in the same location since being built in 1892 however, the foundation came later and was built under the school in 1964. For this reason, the hall scored a 3 under the “site” sub category. The building itself requires minimal work and its condition is very good considering its age. There are some natural features on the property that have remained unmoved. Of note are the trees that were planted around 1925, when reforestry opened in the Anten Mills area and became important to the area economy. This is why the community centre scored a 1 under the “landmark” sub category. Like the other community halls across Springwater, the Anten Mills Community Centre can be seen as a local landmark and a cultural point of reference for the community. It has not only been the community centre for many years, it was the building where generations of residents attended school. It is the focal point of Anten Mills for picnics, baseball games, day camps, card games, strawberry suppers, meeting spot for services clubs, Easter Egg Eggstravaganza, Christmas in the Village, and many more. It is clear that the hall symbolizes the community and is a landmark that many recognize on their travels down Horseshoe Valley Road.

### Summary

As stated before, evaluating a property not only involves understanding the overall context of a community’s heritage and how the property being evaluated fits within that context, but it also involves a clear examination of the property for any physical evidence of its heritage features or attributes. Not only does the Anten Mills Community Centre have significant community context, the property and building itself have significant design and physical value. Many original features of the school house remain providing a glimpse into the community’s past. To see the original brick façade and the old bell tower still intact is a testament to the community’s commitment to ensure the building and its heritage attributes remained for future generations. When looking at pictures of the original school in 1892 to current time, very little has changed and any alterations that have been made continue to represent and support its cultural heritage value. It is for these reasons the Heritage Advisory Committee has recommended to

Council to formally designate the community centre a heritage property under Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

## **Conclusion**

Based on the heritage evaluation outlined above, Council has been provided with three options for the Anten Mills Community Centre including the recommended option from the Heritage Advisory Committee.

The three (3) proposed options are each further explored below and include:

- 1) Formal designation under the OHA (**recommendation of Heritage Committee**)
- 2) No formal heritage designation under the OHA
- 3) Listing the property on the Heritage Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (not designated)

### **Option 1 – Formal Designation under the OHA**

As outlined previously in the August 5<sup>th</sup> report regarding heritage recognition of the Midhurst Community Centre, designating a property under section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act is essentially a six step process as outlined below:

- 1) Identifying the property
- 2) Researching and evaluating the property
- 3) Serving Notice of Intention to Designate
- 4) Passing and registering the heritage designation by-law
- 5) Listing the property on the municipal Heritage Register
- 6) Listing the property on the provincial Heritage Register

The first two steps in the process for the Anten Mills Community Centre have already been completed and this is the option that the Heritage Committee is recommending based on their evaluation. If Council approves that the community centre should be designated, then the next step would be to provide notice of intention to designate. A follow-up report would be prepared for Council's consideration that contains the written statements and descriptions required to support the designation, such as the identification of heritage attributes. This would be completed prior to issuing the Notice of Intention to Designate as this information is a requirement of the notice.

The notice would then be placed in the newspaper outlining Council's intention to designate the Anten Mills Community Centre and will include as per legislation:

- The Description of Property so that it can be readily ascertained;
- The Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest which identifies the property's heritage significance

If no objections are filed with the Township within thirty (30) days after the date of the publication of notice in the newspaper, Council can proceed to pass a by-law designating the property. Once passed, the by-law is registered on the title of the property and notice is provided to the Ontario Heritage Trust and published in the newspaper. To complete the process the property is then listed on the Township's Heritage Register and the Provincial Register as well.

### Heritage Designation and Property Use

A heritage designation does not change the use of a property. That being said, there is an expectation that the property owner will maintain the heritage attributes and make the commitment to do so, as that is the fundamental reason for designation. With the Anten Mills Community Centre being a Township owned property, it is important that the municipality ensures that the heritage attributes are protected for the future. The heritage attributes will be listed within the heritage designation by-law approved by Council.

It should be noted that the Township has designated two (2) of its own properties in the past; Hillsdale Jail and the Penetanguishene Trail. Understanding the importance and significance of these properties has ensured that they are still intact to this day for the public to enjoy. Updates and maintenance have been required for these properties over time and Council has provided funds to do so. Most notably is the replacement of the side windows at the Hillsdale Jail with historically accurate replicas in 2014.

### Making Alterations to the Property

If the Anten Mills Community Centre becomes designated then alterations to the property that affect its heritage attributes must be first approved by Council.

### **Option 2 – No Formal Designation under the OHA**

If the option is chosen to not formally designate the Anten Mills Community Centre, this would mean that the community centre and its heritage attributes would not have any formal protection under the Ontario Heritage Act, and it wouldn't be listed on the Heritage Register.

No formal designation does not diminish the historical and cultural contribution that residents feel that the community centre has, and still does, make to the community. That being said, it's important for Council to consider that it approved the Midhurst Community Centre for formal heritage designation despite scoring lower on the evaluation than the Anten Mills Community Centre. Although each property is objectively evaluated based on its own merits, consideration of previous decisions regarding heritage value of township owned community centres can play a role in the context of decision making for the other halls.

### **Option 3 – List Property on the Municipal Heritage Register (not designated)**

Through guides provided by the Ministry of Heritage, Sport, Tourism and Culture Industries, listing a property of cultural heritage value or interest is the first step a municipality should take in the identification and evaluation of a property that may warrant some form of heritage conservation, recognition and/or long-term protection such as designation. Although listing a property that is not designated does not offer formal protection under the Ontario Heritage Act, it does however have a requirement that the owner of a listed property shall not demolish or remove a building or structure or permit the demolition or removal without giving Council 60 days' notice in writing of their intent to do so. This "buffer" period provides the municipality the opportunity to review and evaluate the property and potentially begin the process of formal designation under section 29 of the OHA.

A Register of cultural heritage properties:

- Recognizes properties of cultural heritage value in a community
- Fosters civic identity and pride by drawing attention to the heritage and development of a community
- Promotes knowledge and enhances an understanding of a community's cultural heritage
- Provides easily accessible information about cultural heritage value for land-use planners, property owners, developers, the tourism industry, educators and the general public
- Is a central element of a municipal cultural plan that begins with mapping local cultural resources and then leverages these resources for economic development and community building

In reviewing Springwater's current Municipal Heritage Register, there are many Township owned properties that are listed and recognized for their cultural and heritage value without being designated. This includes the Midhurst Union Pioneer Cemetery, the Knox Building in Elmvale, and the Elmvale Hydro Service Building to name a few. These properties are significant to Springwater's past and enhance the cultural heritage of our current communities. This could be a viable option in recognizing the Anten Mills Community Centre and its value and history.

### **Financial Implications**

The Heritage Advisory Committee conducted the evaluation during a regular scheduled meeting. As such, no additional costs were incurred to complete the evaluation. Remuneration paid to Committee members for regular scheduled meetings is budgeted for.

If Council approves to formally designate the Anten Mills Community Centre, then there will be costs associated with placing the notices in the local newspaper and to register the designation by-law on title for the property. If the Township's intent to designate is appealed during the notice period, then there will be possible costs associated with the matter being heard at the Conservation Review Board.

There are no financial implications related to choosing the option to not formally designate the Anten Mills Community Centre or the option to list it on the Heritage Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (not designated). For listing the property, it would be added to the Register that is publicly available on the Township's website.

### **Pillars of Commitment**

Not applicable.

### **Approvals**

**Submitted by:** Sasha Helmkey, B.A., Dipl.M.A., Deputy Clerk

**Reviewed by:** Renée Ainsworth, AOMC. Clerk

**Financial Implications Reviewed by:** Jeff Schmidt, CPA, CGA, Chief Administrative Officer

**Approved by:** Jeff Schmidt, CPA, CGA, Chief Administrative Officer

**Version Code:** C04 2020-09-30 7:47 AM 2374576

SHARED/C - Council, Boards, By-Laws and Resolutions\C04 Reports to Council\Clerk's Department\2020

### **Applicable Municipal Policy or Legislation**

[Ontario Heritage Act](#)

### **Attachments**

Schedule "A" - Heritage Evaluation Guidelines and Form

Schedule "B" – Anten Mills Community Centre Heritage Evaluation

### **Background or Relevant Reports on Subject**

[2018-05-16 Heritage Committee – Evaluation of Community Halls](#)

[2019-12-03 Heritage Advisory Committee Agenda - History of Anten Mills Community Centre](#)